

Neuroeconomics



Neuroeconomics
Decision making and the brain

p0010

Edited by

p0020

Paul W. Glimcher, PhD
Center for Neural Science
4 Washington Place, 809
New York, NY 10013

p0030

p0040

p0050



AMSTERDAM • BOSTON • HEIDELBERG • LONDON
NEW YORK • OXFORD • PARIS • SAN DIEGO
SAN FRANCISCO • SINGAPORE • SYDNEY • TOKYO
Academic Press is an imprint of Elsevier





p0070 Academic Press is an imprint of Elsevier

p0080 832 Jamestown Road, London NW1 7BY, UK
p0090 525 B Street, Suite 1900, San Diego, California 92101-4495, USA
p0100 30 Corporate Drive, Suite 400, Burlington, MA 01803, USA

p0110 First edition 2009

p0120 Copyright © 2009, Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

p0130 No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

p0140 Permissions may be sought directly from Elsevier's Science & Technology Rights Department in Oxford, UK: phone: (+44) 1865 843830, fax: (+44) 1865 853333, E-mail: permissions@elsevier.com. You may also complete your request online via the Elsevier homepage (<http://elsevier.com>), by selecting "Support & Contact" then "Copyright and Permission" and then "Obtaining Permissions."

p0150 **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**
p0160 A catalog record for this book available from the Library of Congress

p0170 **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**
p0180 A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

p0190 ISBN: 978-0-12-374176-9

p0200 For information on all Academic Press publications
p0210 visit our Web site at www.books.elsevier.com

Typeset by Charon Tec Ltd (A Macmillan Company), Chennai, India
www.charontec.com

p0200 Printed in the United States of America
p0230 09 10 11 12 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

<p>Working together to grow libraries in developing countries</p> <p>www.elsevier.com www.bookaid.org www.sabre.org</p>		
ELSEVIER	BOOK AID International	Sabre Foundation





p0250

Contents

p0260	<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>xv</i>
p0270	1. Introduction: A Brief History of Neuroeconomics	1
p0280	<i>Paul W. Glimcher, Colin Camerer, Ernst Fehr, and Russell Poldrack</i>	
p0290	Neoclassical economics	1
p0300	Cognitive neuroscience	5
	Setting the stage for neuroeconomics	6
p0310	Two trends, one goal	7
p0320	Summary	11
p0330	References	11
p0340	Part I: Neoclassical Economic Approaches to the Brain	13
p0350	2. Introduction: Experimental Economics and Neuroeconomics	15
p0360	<i>Vernon L. Smith</i>	
p0370	Introduction	15
p0380	The internal order: rewards and the brain	16
p0390	The social order	17
p0400	The market order	18
p0410	References	18
p0420	3. Axiomatic Neuroeconomics	21
p0430	<i>Andrew Caplin and Mark Dean</i>	
p0440	Introduction	21
p0450	The axiomatic method in decision theory	22
p0460	Axioms and neuroeconomics: the case of dopamine and reward prediction error	24
p0470	Conclusion remarks	30
p0480	References	31



p0490	4. Neuroeconomics: Formal Models of Decision-making and Cognitive Neuroscience	33
p0500	<i>Aldo Rustichini</i>	
p0510	Introduction	33
p0520	Axiomatic decision theory	34
p0530	Static stochastic choice	36
p0540	Dynamic stochastic choice	38
p0550	Decision in perceptual tasks	39
p0560	The computation of utility	40
p0570	Factors affecting the decision process	40
p0580	Cognitive abilities and preferences	42
p0590	Appendix: Random walk with endogenous barriers	43
	Optimal policy	44
	Value and quality of signals	44
p0600	References	45
p0610	5. Experimental Neuroeconomics and Non-cooperative Games	47
p0620	<i>Daniel Houser and Kevin McCabe</i>	
p0630	Introduction	47
p0640	Game theory experiments	54
p0650	Neuroeconomics experiments	57
p0660	Towards a neuroeconomic theory of behavior in games	60
p0670	Conclusion	61
p0680	References	61
p0690	6. Games in Humans and Non-human Primates: Scanners to Single Units	63
p0700	<i>Alan Sanfey and Michael Dorris</i>	
p0710	Introduction	63
p0720	Game theory	64
p0730	Games in non-human primates	66
p0740	Games in humans	72
p0750	Conclusion	77
p0760	References	78
p0770	7. The Evolution of Rational and Irrational Economic Behavior: Evidence and Insight from a Non-human Primate	81
p0780	<i>Laurie R. Santos and M. Keith Chen</i>	
p0790	Introduction	81

p0800	Neoclassical approaches to non-standard behavior	82
p0810	The role for non-human primate studies in modern economics	84
p0820	Primate evolution 101	85
p0830	Revealing capuchin preferences: the token trading methodology	87
p0840	Do capuchins obey price theory as humans do?	88
p0850	Do capuchins display the same biases as humans	88
p0860	What comparative work means for traditional economics and neuroeconomics	90
p0870	References	92
p0880	8. The Expected Utility of Movement	95
p0890	<i>Julia Trommershäuser, Laurence T. Maloney, and Michael S. Landy</i>	
p0900	Introduction	95
p0910	Movement planning as optimization	96
p0920	Movement planning and decision-making	104
p0930	Neural correlates of motor and cognitive decisions	108
p0940	Conclusion	109
p0950	References	109
p0960	Part II: Behavioral Economics and the Brain	113
p0970	9. The Psychology and Neurobiology of Judgment and Decision-making: What's in it for Economists?	115
p0980	<i>B. Douglas Bernheim</i>	
p0990	Introduction	115
p1000	A framework for discussion	116
p1010	Is the relevance of neuroeconomics self-evident?	117
p1020	Some specific sources of skepticism	118
p1030	Are there uses for exogenous neuroeconomic variables?	119
p1040	Are there uses for endogenous neuroeconomic variables	120
p1050	Do economic theories have testable implications concerning neural processes?	120
p1060	Can an understanding of neural processes usefully guide model selection?	121
p1070	Can neuroeconomics improve out-of-sample predictions?	123
p1080	Conclusion	124
p1090	References	124
p1100	10. Decisions Under Uncertainty: Psychological, Economic, and Neuroeconomic Explanations of Risk Preference	127
p1110	<i>Elke U. Weber and Eric J. Johnson</i>	
p1120	Risk preference: the historical context	127

p1130	Decisions under uncertainty	130
p1140	Modeling decision-making under uncertainty	133
p1150	Summary and implications	140
p1160	References	142
p1170	11. Prospect Theory and the Brain	145
p1180	<i>Craig R. Fox and Russell A. Poldrack</i>	
p1190	Introduction	145
p1200	Prospect theory measurement	154
p1210	Neuroscientific data	165
p1220	Conclusions and future directions	169
	Appendix	170
p1230	References	170
p1240	12. Values and Actions in Aversion	175
p1250	<i>Peter Dayan and Ben Seymour</i>	
p1260	Introduction	175
p1270	The architecture of affective decision-making	176
p1280	Pavlovian influences over instrumental behavior	181
p1290	Aversively motivated behavior	186
p1300	Conclusion	188
p1310	References	188
p1320	13. Behavioral Game Theory and the Neural Basis of Strategic Choice	193
p1330	<i>Colin F. Camerer</i>	
p1340	Game theory	193
p1350	Behavioral game theory	194
	Social preferences over outcomes	195
p1360	Psychological and neural evidence	199
p1370	Conclusions and future research	204
p1380	References	205
p1390	Part III: Social Decision-making, Neuroeconomics, and Emotion	207
p1400	14. Neuroscience and the Emergence of Neuroeconomics	209
p1410	<i>Antonio Damasio</i>	
p1420	From neuroscience to neuroeconomics	209

p1430	Decision-making, emotion, and biological value	212
p1440	References	213
p1450	15. Social Preferences and the Brain	215
p1460	<i>Ernst Fehr</i>	
p1470	Introduction	215
p1480	Behavior and motives	217
p1490	Anticipating others' social preferences	220
p1500	Exploring the neural circuitry of social preferences – methodological concerns	221
p1510	The neurobiology of other-regarding punishment behavior	222
p1520	The neurobiology of trust and trustworthiness	228
p1530	Conclusions	229
p1540	References	230
p1620	16. Understanding Others: Brain Mechanisms of Theory of Mind and Empathy	233
p1630	<i>Tania Singer</i>	
p1640	Introduction	233
p1650	Defining concepts	236
p1660	The study of “theory of mind”	237
p1670	The study of empathy and feelings	238
p1680	Open questions and implications for future research in neuroeconomics	244
p1690	References	247
p1550	17. The Study of Emotion in Neuroeconomics	251
p1560	<i>Elizabeth A. Phelps</i>	
p1570	Introduction	251
p1580	Defining components of emotion and affect	252
p1590	Categories of emotion and affective experience	255
p1600	Manipulating and measuring emotion in research	257
	Emotion and affect in economic and neuroeconomic research	260
p1610	References	263
p1700	18. Social Preferences in Primates	267
p1710	<i>Joan B. Silk</i>	
p1720	Introduction	267
p1730	The adaptive challenge of altruism	268
p1740	The deployment of altruism in primate groups	269

p1750	Primate policing and punishment	271
p1760	Cognitive basis of social preferences	272
p1770	Empirical evidence for empathy and sympathy	273
p1780	Social preferences in primates	274
p1790	Conclusions	280
p1800	References	281
p1810	19. Responses to Inequity in Non-human Primates	283
p1820	<i>Sarah F. Brosnan</i>	
p1830	Introduction	283
p1840	Inequity aversion	284
p1850	Why non-human primates are relevant to equity	287
p1860	Reactions to inequity in non-human primates	289
p1870	Conclusions	297
p1880	References	298
p1890	20. Neuroeconomics of Charitable Giving and Philanthropy	301
p1900	<i>Ulrich Mayr, William T. Harbaugh, and Dharol Tankersley</i>	
p1910	Introduction	301
p1920	Some economics of public goods and charitable giving	302
p1930	Neural-level evidence	307
p1940	Conclusion	316
p1950	References	317
p1960	Part IV: Understanding Valuation – Learning Valuations	319
p1970	21. Midbrain Dopamine Neurons: A Retina of the Reward System?	321
p1980	<i>Wolfram Schultz</i>	
p1990	Introduction	321
p2000	Concepts of reward	322
p2010	Dopamine reward-related responses	323
p2020	Dopamine reward risk signal	325
p2030	Dopamine confusions	325
p2040	Conclusions	326
p2050	References	326

p2060	22. Theoretical and Empirical Studies of Learning	329
p2070	<i>Yael Niv and P. Read Montague</i>	
p2080	Introduction	329
p2090	Reinforcement learning: theoretical and historical background	330
p2100	Application of reinforcement learning models to neural data	335
p2110	Evidence from imaging of human decision-making	340
p2120	Beyond prediction errors and phasic dopamine	342
p2130	What's missing? Challenges and future directions	344
p2140	Conclusion	345
p2150	References	346
p2160	23. The Neurobiological Foundations of Valuation in Human Decision-making Under Uncertainty	351
p2170	<i>Peter Bossaerts, Kerstin Preuschoff, and Ming Hsu</i>	
p2180	Introduction	351
p2190	Distinguishing valuation and choice	353
p2200	Valuation under pure risk: trading off risk against reward	356
p2210	Extending the reward–risk computational model to ambiguity	358
p2220	Extending the reward–risk computational model to decisions involving equity and efficiency	361
p2230	References	363
p2240	24. Multiple Forms of Value Learning and the Function of Dopamine	365
p2250	<i>Bernard W. Balleine, Nathaniel D. Daw, and John O'Doherty</i>	
p2260	Introduction	365
p2270	Reward, prediction, and reinforcement	366
p2280	Reinforcement learning	372
p2290	Neural basis of reinforcement learning	375
p2300	Conclusions	382
p2310	References	383
p2320	25. Representation of Subjective Value in the Striatum	387
p2330	<i>Brian Knutson, Mauricio R. Delgado, and Paul E. M. Phillips</i>	
p2340	Introduction	387
p2350	Structure	389
	Function	391
p2360	Prediction	399

p2370	Implications	399
p2380	References	401
p2390	26. The Basal Ganglia and the Encoding of Value	405
p2400	<i>Kenji Doya and Minoru Kimura</i>	
p2410	Introduction	405
p2420	Action-value coding in striatal neurons	406
p2430	Short- and long-term reward prediction in the striatum	407
p2440	Centromedian thalamic neurons	410
p2450	Motivation and outcome coding in dopamine neurons	411
p2460	Conclusions	412
p2470	References	413
p2480	Part V: The Neural Mechanisms for Choice	415
p2490	27. The Neural Mechanisms that Underlie Decision-making	417
p2500	<i>Charles R. Gallistel</i>	
p2510	Introduction	417
p2520	Can/should neurobiological data constrain economic theorizing?	418
p2530	Matching	420
p2540	References	422
p2550	28. The Computation and Comparison of Value in Goal-directed Choice	423
p2560	<i>Antonio Rangel</i>	
p2570	Introduction	423
p2580	Preliminaries: what is goal-directed choice and what needs to be computed?	424
p2590	Perceptual decision-making	425
p2600	Simple goal-directed choice	431
p2610	Final remarks	436
p2620	References	437
p2630	29. Neuronal Representations of Value	439
p2640	<i>Michael Platt and Camillo Padoa-Schioppa</i>	
p2650	Introduction	440
p2660	Economic choice and the orbitofrontal cortex	440
p2670	Valuation signals in parietal cortex	446
p2680	Evaluation of events and actions in posterior cingulate cortex	450
p2690	Neuro-cognitive models of choice	454
p2700	Conclusion	457
p2710	References	457

p2720	30. The Trouble with Choice: Studying Decision Variables in the Brain	461
p2730	<i>Greg. S. Corrado, Leo P. Sugrue, Julian R. Brown, and William T. Newsome</i>	
p2740	Introduction	461
p2750	Direct methods for accessing decision variables	463
p2760	Model-based approaches	465
p2770	Validating behavioral performance	472
p2780	The quest for neural correlates	474
p2790	Conclusion	476
p2800	References	477
p2810	31. Mechanisms for Stochastic Decision-making in the Primate Frontal Cortex: Single-neuron Recording and Circuit Modeling	479
p2820	<i>Daeyeol Lee and Xiao-Jing Wang</i>	
p2830	Introduction	479
p2840	Game-theoretic studies of decision-making in non-human primates	481
p2850	Neurophysiological studies of decision-making in competitive games	485
p2860	Models of decision-making	488
p2870	Reward-dependent plasticity and adaptive choice behavior	493
p2880	Conclusion	497
p2890	References	498
p2900	32. Choice: Towards a Standard Back-pocket Model	501
p2910	<i>Paul W. Glimcher</i>	
p2920	Introduction	501
p2930	Introducing the basic two-stage model	502
p2940	Defining objects	505
p2950	The basic structure of the valuation system	509
p2960	Choice	513
p2970	Alternatives to the two-stage model	516
p2980	Conclusion	517
p2990	References	518
p3000	33. Remarks on Neuroeconomics	521
p3010	<i>Daniel Kahneman</i>	
	References	524
p3020	<i>Index</i>	525



Contributors

- p0010 **Bernard W. Balleine** UCLA Department of
p0020 Psychology, 1285 Franz Hall, Los Angeles, CA
 90095-1563, USA
- p0030 **D. Douglas Bernheim** Department of Economics,
p0040 Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-6072, USA
- p0050 **Peter Bossaerts** Laboratory for Decision
p0060 Making under Uncertainty, École Polytechnique
 Fédérale Lausanne (EPFL), Station 5, 1015 Lausanne,
 Switzerland
- p0070 **Sarah F. Brosnan** Department of Psychology,
p0080 Georgia State University, Atlanta, GA 30302-5010,
 USA
- p0090 **Julian R. Brown** Howard Hughes Medical
p0100 Institute and Department of Neurobiology, Stanford
 University School of Medicine, Fairchild Building,
 Room D200, 299 Campus Drive West, Stanford, CA
 94305, USA
- p0110 **Colin F. Camerer** Axline Professor of Business
p0120 Economics, California Institute of Technology,
p0130 Pasadena, CA 91125, USA
- p0140 **Andrew Caplin** Department of Economics, New
p0150 York University, 269 Mercer Street, New York, NY
 10003, USA
- p0160 **M. Keith Chen** Yale School of Management,
p0170 135 Prospect Street, New Haven, CT 06520-8200, USA
- p0180 **Greg S. Corrado** Howard Hughes Medical
p0190 Institute and Department of Neurobiology, Stanford
 University School of Medicine, Fairchild Building,
 Room D200, 299 Campus Drive West, Stanford, CA
 94305, USA
- p0200 **Antonio Damasio** David Dornsife Professor
p0210 of Neuroscience and Director, Brain and Creativity
 Institute, University of Southern California, Los
 Angeles, CA 90089-2520, USA
- p0220 **Nathaniel D. Daw** Department of Psychology,
p0230 New York University, 6 Washington Place, New York,
 NY 10003, USA
- Peter Dayan** Gatsby Computational Neuroscience p0240
 Unit, Alexandra House, 17 Queen Square, London p0250
 WC1N 3AR, UK
- Mark Dean** Department of Economics, New York p0260
 University, 19 West 4th Street, New York, NY 1003, USA p0270
- Mauricio R. Delgado** Department of Psychology, p0280
 Rutgers University, 101 Warren Street, Smith Hall, p0290
 Newyork, NJ 07102, USA
- David Dornsife** Department of Neuroscience, p0300
 University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA p0310
 90089-2520, USA p0320
 p0330
 p0340
- Michael Dorris** Department of Physiology, p0350
 Queen's University, 18 Stuart Street, Botterell Hall, p0360
 Kingston, ON K7L3N6, Canada
- Kenji Doya** Neural Computation Unit, Okinawa p0370
 Institute of Science and Technology, 12-22 Suzaki, p0380
 Uruma, Okinawa 904-2234, Japan
- Ernst Fehr** Institute for Empirical Research in p0390
 Economics, University of Zurich, Blümlisalpstrasse 10, p0400
 CH-8006 Zurich, Switzerland
- Craig R. Fox** UCLA Anderson School and p0410
 Department of Psychology, 110 Westwood Plaza p0420
 #D511, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1481, USA
- Charles R. Gallistel** Rutgers Center for Cognitive p0430
 Science, Psychology Building Addition, Busch p0440
 Campus, 152 Frelinghuysen Road, Piscataway, NJ
 08854-8020, USA
- Paul W. Glimcher** Center for Neuroeconomics, p0450
 New York University, 6 Washington Place, New York, p0460
 NY 10013, USA
- William T. Harbaugh** Department of Economics, p0470
 University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403-1285, USA p0480
- Daniel Houser** Interdisciplinary Center for p0490
 Economic Science (ICES), 4400 University Drive, p0500
 Fairfax, VA 22030, USA
- Ming Hsu** Department of Economics, University p0510
 of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 405 North Mathews p0520
 Avenue, Urbana, IL 61801, USA

- p0530 **Eric J. Johnson** Columbia Business School, Uris
p0540 Hall, 3022 Broadway, New York, NY 10027, USA
p0550
- p0560 **Daniel Kahneman** Center for Health and
p0570 Well-Being, 322 Wallace Hall, Princeton University,
Princeton, NJ 08544, USA
- p0580 **Minoru Kimura** Division of Neurophysiology,
p0590 Kyoto Prefectural University of Medicine,
Kawaramachi-Hirokoji, Makigyō-ku, Kyoto 602-8566,
Japan
- p0600 **Brian Knutson** Department of Psychology and
p0610 Neuroscience, Stanford University, 470 Jordan Hall,
Stanford, CA 94305-2130, USA
- p0620 **Michael S. Landy** Department of Psychology
p0630 and Center for Neural Science, New York University,
6 Washington Place, New York, NY 10003, USA
- p0640 **Daeyeol Lee** Yale University School of Medicine,
p0650 Department of Neurobiology, 333 Cedar Street, New
Haven, CT 06510, USA
- p0660 **Laurence T. Maloney** Department of Psychology
p0670 and Center for Neural Science, New York University,
6 Washington Place, New York, NY 10003, USA
- p0680 **Ulrich Mayr** Department of Psychology,
p0690 University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403-1227,
USA
- p0700 **Kevin McCabe** Department of Economics, George
p0710 Mason University, Fairfax, VA 22030-4444, USA
- p0720 **P. Read Montague** Department of Neuroscience,
p0730 Baylor College of Medicine, 1 Baylor Plaza, Houston,
TX 7703, USA
- p0740 **William T. Newsome** Howard Hughes Medical
p0750 Institute and Department of Neurobiology, Stanford
University School of Medicine, Fairchild Building,
Room D209, 299 Campus Drive West, Stanford, CA
94305, USA
- p0760 **Yael Niv** 1 Washington Square Village, New York,
p0770 NY 10012, USA
- p0780 **John O'Doherty** California Institute of Technology,
p0790 1200 E California Boulevard, Pasadena, CA 91125, USA
- p0800 **Camillo Padoa-Schioppa** Department of
p0810 Neurobiology, Harvard Medical School, 220
Longwood Avenue, Boston, MA 02115, USA
- p0820 **Elizabeth A. Phelps** The Phelps Lab, Meyer Hall,
p0830 New York University, 6 Washington Place, New York,
NY 10003, USA
- p0840 **Paul E. M. Phillips** Department of Psychiatry &
p0850 Behavioral Sciences and Department of Pharmacology,
University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195-6560,
USA
- Michael Platt** Department of Neurobiology, Duke
University Medical Center, 427E Bryan Research
Building, Durham, NC 27710, USA
- Russell A. Poldrack** UCLA Department of Psychology
1285 Franz Hall, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1563,
USA
- Kerstin Preuschoff** University of Zurich,
Blümlisalpstrasse 10, CH-8006 Zurich, Switzerland
- Antonio Rangel** California Institute of Technology
(Caltech), HSS 228-77, Pasadena, CA 91125-7700, USA
- Aldo Rustichini** Department of Economics,
University of Minnesota, 1035 Heller Hall, 271 19th
Avenue South, Minneapolis, MN 55455, USA
- Alan Sanfey** Department of Psychology,
University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85719, USA
- Laurie R. Santos** Department of Psychology, Yale
University, New Haven, CT 06510, USA
- Wolfram Schultz** Department of Physiology,
Development and Neuroscience, University of
Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge CB2 3DY, UK
- Ben Seymour** Wellcome Department of Imaging
Neuroscience, University College London, London
WC1N 3BG, UK
- Joan B. Silk** UCLA Department of Anthropology,
341 Haines Hall, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1553, USA
- Tania Singer** Center for Social Neuroscience and
Neuroeconomics, University of Zurich, Blümlisalp-
strasse 10, CH-8006 Zurich, Switzerland
- Vernon L. Smith** Department of Economics,
MSN 3G4, George Mason University, Fairfax, VA
22030-4444, USA
- Leo P. Sugrue** Howard Hughes Medical Institute
and Department of Neurobiology, Stanford University
School of Medicine, Fairchild Building, Room D200,
Stanford, CA 94305, USA
- Dharol Tankersley** Brain Imaging and Analysis
Center, Duke University Medical Centre, Durham, NC
27710, USA
- Julia Trommershäuser** Department of Psychology,
Giessen University, Otto-Behagel-Str. 10F, 35394
Giessen, Germany
- Xiao-Jing Wang** Department of Neurobiology,
Yale University School of Medicine, 333 Cedar Street,
New Haven, CT 06510, USA
- Elke U. Weber** Department of Psychology,
Columbia University, 1190 Amsterdam Avenue, New
York, NY 10027, USA